

The purpose of this assignment is to demonstrate your ability to apply your skills, knowledge and understanding to answer a historical question of your choice.



# S3 Assignment

You have an open choice and can choose any topic that you are interested in. It must be a topic where there is some debate as to why something happened or how successful something was.

The best types of questions start with the following:

- ◆ To what extent did
- ◆ How important was
- ◆ How significant was
- ◆ How far can it be argued that

E.g.

To what extent was William Wallace the most important reason for Scottish success in the Wars of Independence?

To what extent was the discovery of Penicillin the most important medical discovery since 1700?

To what extent was Rosa Parks the most important person in the US Civil Rights movement?

To what extent were the economic crises which faced Germany the main reason the rise to power of the Nazis between 1919-33?

How important were the Suffragettes in helping women gain the vote in 1918?

How important was the Tank to British success in WWI?

How significant was the election of Abraham Lincoln in the outbreak of the civil war?

**Create a mind map of spider diagram from what you know already about this topic which shows the main factors which are of relevance**



**Background** – i.e. what happened before the period you have chosen?

You should now begin your research into your topic. Your research could come from primary or secondary sources including reliable websites, textbooks or history books for example.

**You should have evidence from at least 3 sources and you should keep a record of where you took information from so that it can be referenced.** If you're using a book for example, then you should make a note of the author, the name of the book and the date.

If you're using the internet then you must keep a note of the web addresses you take information from.

You should put all of the information into your own words

You should **describe 3 different factors** and give **2 detailed points** for each of the 3 factors. You should also try to identify counter arguments – reasons why the factor was not so important

## Model

**Question** - How important were the Suffragettes in helping women gain the vote in 1918?

| Factor 1 - Suffragettes   |  |
|---|--|
| Focus on what made this factor important  | Source   |
| <p><del>Emmeline Pankhurst was born in 1858</del><br/><b>DOESN'T EXPLAIN WHY THIS FACTOR WAS IMPORTANT</b></p> <p>The Suffragettes used militant tactics such as chaining themselves to railings and pouring acid in postal boxes to destroy letters.</p> <p>In 1912, the Suffragettes applied new militant tactics as hundreds of women took to the streets of London. They attacked shops on Oxford Street and The Strand smashing windows and even threw stones at 10 Downing Street. 120 women were arrested that day as they made no attempt to hide the hammers they had used.</p> <p>These militant tactics gained publicity and place the government under great pressure to give women the vote.</p> | <p><a href="http://www.johndclare.net/Women1_cjbooks.htm">http://www.johndclare.net/Women1_cjbooks.htm</a></p> |
| <b>CHALLENGE</b> Counter Argument – can you think of a reason why this factor could be considered to be less important  |  |
| Knowledge   | Source   |
| <p>A Suffragette Emily Davison died at the Derby in 1913. She had been trying to attach a banner onto the King's horse Anmer.</p> <p>"Davison was a martyr to the Suffragette cause; her actions were brave but seemed to reinforce the fact that women could not be trusted with the vote."</p>  | <p><i>KS3 History - Sparey, Berry, Jackson and Pearson</i></p>   |
| <b>Evaluation</b> – is this factor more or less important than your other factors and why?  |  |
| <br><br><br><br>  |  |

# Write - up



Your assignment should -

- Provide the historical background to your issue
- Include three detailed sections with knowledge, analysis/argument and evaluation
- Reference at least 3 sources
- Reach a conclusion that answers the question and outlines clear reasons
- Have a visual impact

To what extent was the leadership of Bonnie prince Charlie an important reason for the Jacobite loss at Culloden in 1746?

# To what extent was the leadership of Bonnie prince Charlie an important reason for the Jacobite loss at Culloden in 1746?

**Historical background -**  
The Jacobites were followers of James II who believed that the Stuart's were the rightful Kings of England and Scotland. Under Bonnie Prince Charlie the Jacobites rose up in 1745 to fight the British government. This rebellion ended with the Jacobite defeat at Culloden in 1746.

## 1. Leadership of Bonnie Prince Charlie

Leadership was an important reason why the Jacobites lost because Bonnie Prince Charlie was an inexperienced commander. He had never commanded an army before the Battle of Culloden and as a result he made many errors such as delaying the charge. Lord George Murray had led the Jacobites to their victories at Prestonpans and at Falkirk would have been a better choice but had fallen out with the prince. **Arguably**, Bonnie Prince Charlie's leadership was an important reason in the Jacobite loss because by delaying the charge the Jacobites were easy targets for the Redcoat artillery.

## 2. The battlefield

The choice of battlefield was also a reason why the Jacobites lost. The main Jacobite tactic was the Highland charge where the Jacobites would charge screaming at the enemy. However, Culloden Moor was flat and boggy and did not suit the Highland charge because the boggy areas slowed them down and there was no slope to give the charge some momentum. **Arguably** this makes the battlefield an important reason for the Jacobite loss because this made the Jacobites too slow and by the time they arrived at the Redcoat lines many of them were already dead. **In evaluation**, while the battlefield was important it was not as important as the leadership of Bonnie Prince Charlie because the Prince's leadership did not just delay the charge but was also crucial in choosing the unhelpful battlefield.

### 3. Numbers

Another important reason why the Jacobites lost was the fact that they were outnumbered. The Jacobites were outnumbered around 9000 to 6000.

([http://www.bbc.co.uk/history/scottishhistory/union/trails\\_union\\_culloden.shtml](http://www.bbc.co.uk/history/scottishhistory/union/trails_union_culloden.shtml)) **Arguably** ...

**However**, in previous battles the Jacobites had been outnumbered but had won.

**Arguably** this shows that...**In evaluation**...

If you have a counter argument use the word 'however'.

Some of you may want to find a quote - eg "If Lord George Murray had led the Jacobites at Culloden the result may have been different" (Culloden, J.Smith, 2005)

### Conclusion

In conclusion, the leadership of Bonnie Prince Charlie was an important reason for the Jacobite defeat to a great extent. On the one hand, the flat battlefield was an important reason because it prevented the Jacobites from using their main tactic effectively. On the other hand, the Redcoats numerical advantage was an important reason because... However, the most important reason for the defeat of the Jacobites was the leadership of Bonnie Prince Charlie because...